

Risk & Environmental Justice

Don Lloyd

Professor of Sustainability & Risk Management

Content & Context

Content

- Risk (from a Company perspective) vs Environmental Justice (from a Community perspective)

Context

- The Current Energy ‘Trilemma’ i.e. how best to balance:
 - Energy Security (availability)
 - Energy Cost (Affordability)
 - Climate Change
- Role of Gas a ‘transition’ fuel (the ‘least worst’ fossil fuel)

Large Unconventional Gas Project

- \$20bn Capital Cost
- >2,000 wells – coal seam gas
- ~350km pipeline
- Gas Liquefaction Plant + Export Jetty
- Complex Land Access/Native Title considerations
- Company drive to be ‘first mover’ (relative to 3 similar projects)

Environmental Approvals Process

- Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) – to be prepared by company and submitted to state & federal regulators
- Approval can be granted subject to specified conditions
- Detailed environmental permits required prior to the start on site

EIS Consultation

- **1. EIS Terms of Reference**
- General project overview, potential impacts, monitoring/assessment methodology
- 7 week public consultation (Town Hall briefings, meetings with NGO')
- NGO's focused on 'matters of national environmental significance' (e.g. Impact of dredging on Great Barrier Reef)
- Little 'Local community' interest

EIS Consultant (continued)

2. 'Full' EIS

- Detailed process design/general information on location
- 7 week consultation (meetings with key NGO's and many community meetings)
- Aim to explain proposal, associated impacts/risks and Environmental Management Plans
- EIS approved subject to 3,000 conditions (e.g. monitoring requirements)

EIS Consultation (continued)

3. Environmental Permits

- Each permit requires local consultation
- Detailed process design and well/equipment location
- Waves of protest from ‘affected’ residents/communities



Company Perspective

- We have produced a very detailed EIS that assesses risks and satisfies stringent Environmental Regulations
- We have conducted extensive consultation and have been open in our efforts to explain
- We will comply with all permit conditions
- We have done all that is required of us

‘Societal’ / Community Perspective

NGO’s

- There is significant scientific uncertainty. The ‘precautionary principle’ should apply and all work should stop pending a firmer consensus

Local Communities

- Why did you not tell us that we would be affected much earlier?
- We have been duped by company and Government

Lessons Learnt

- Engagement style was very transactional linked to project timescales and key milestones
- The focus was on demonstrating regulatory compliance... this is necessary but not sufficient.
- Concerns re ‘Environmental Justice’ underpinned more by lack of trust/openness than risk addressed in the EIS
- Need to move from ‘telling’ to ‘listening and engaging’
- More generally – highlights importance of open collaboration as per UNSDG 17 “Partnership for the Goals” in promoting a ‘Just Transition’

PANEL THEME : GOVERNANCE AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

Date: Thursday July 27, 2023

Time: 12:00 noon – 1:15pm

Olanrewaju A. Fagbohun, *PhD, SAN*
Professor of Environmental Law

Fascinating Goals of Governance & Environmental Justice

- **Twin Goals:** Improved environmental performance | sustainable development |
- **Environmental justice**, is the right to a safe, healthy, productive and sustainable environment for all.
- **Some Governance Tools**
 - *Procedural Justice:* Recognition | Acknowledgment | Participation |
 - *Distributive Justice:* equal & fair distribution of Opportunities | Benefits | Risk |

Reality Check...

- Governance regime of environmental justice is struggling... *many laws, not much traction.*
- ❖ Ecosystems continue to be degraded or used unsustainably: *Species extinction | Toxic wastes | Dwindling forests | Rise in carbon emission | Disappearing biodiversity |*
- ❖ Exposure to pollution with serious adverse consequences on quality of life.
- In terms of sustainable development, global distribution of wealth is devoid of real justice – *(In the face of poverty, environmental protection is a mirage).*

Unequal Inheritance, and Recurring Contradictions

Global Power Politics



Multinationals & Domestic Corporations

- Law making is the monopoly of the few (constraints on global player/UN specialized agencies);
 - Predominance of self-interest;
 - Leadership deficit (corruption);
 - Manipulation of laws, policies & institutions (soft laws);
- ❖ Unfavourable compromises and patchwork of therapies
 - ❖ Green Financing : Bogus consultancies | Perverse incentives | Dumping |
- Maximization of returns;
 - Hijack of concepts/ principles;
 - Dirty technologies & stranded assets;
 - Corruption;

Tracing the Map of Possibilities

The Role of Higher Education.

- Can universities set the **Agenda** and take the **Lead**...
 - ❖ Deepen training on ethical leadership and behavioural changes?
 - ❖ Revisit discussion that will reduce ambiguity of definition of critical concepts against the background of what we now know?
 - ❖ What strategies can bring us together in a collective way to lead conversations and incubate solutions?
 - ❖ How can we rethink/prioritize solutions to poverty?
- *Universities think long term... we can amortise that advantage.*

I thank you all.

Just Transition: Localization of SDGs and implementing at-scale

Sameer Sharma, (PhD-USA, Dlitt)

Overarching focus

- **Livability – Clean Air, Clean Water and Clean Soil**
- **and,**
- **Removing poverty in all forms**

The Challenge

- **Eradicating extreme poverty and stopping climate change are two urgent global challenges, and they can only be tackled together.**
- **Emissions reductions needed to stop climate change have to be achieved through a just transition, which in particular protects the poorest and most vulnerable.**

Our Approach

- **The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), aspiring to a ‘better and more sustainable future for all’, attest to the combined importance of these issues.**
- **Protection of poor and vulnerable requires that their human capabilities are developed.**
- **Story of how we are doing this within the framework of the SDGs – at scale and at the local level and in the transition.**



The Andhra Pradesh Model

The political buy-in

- **Andhra Pradesh is committed to achieve 17 Goals by 2030.**
- **Policy level - Andhra Pradesh has adopted the global development agenda and aligned its annual budget with the SDGs.**
- **Localization- At the Village and Ward Secretariat level.**

Three-step top-down process

Broad Principles

- Mapping of schemes and disaggregation of SDGs and targets at Village/Ward level
- Only activities and corresponding indicators which can be best done at the higher levels would be monitored at state/district level

SDGs: Top-Down 3-Step process

PART
-1

- Development of 475 SIF
- Develop SoPs for 115 priority indicators
- Portal to monitor the progress

PART
-2

- Mapping of programmes to SDGs
- Identification of specific activities
- Target setting at VWS-level

PART
-3

- Capacity building at all levels
- Orientation and Continuous training at all levels
- All officers and staff covered

Mapping (1)

- **Goal to indicator to Department**
 - **Prepared a State Indicator Framework (SIF) consisting of 475 indicators based on the 17 SDGs.**
 - **These were mapped to Government Departments.**

Sl.No.	Secretariat Department Name	Head of Department	Indicators for the Head of Department
1	Agriculture And Cooperation	Commissioner of Agriculture	23
		Commissioner of Horticulture	2
		CEO. Ryss	2
		Commissioner of Marketing	4
2	Animal Husbandry And Fisheries	Director of AH	1
		Commissioner of Fisheries	7
3	BC Welfare	Commissioner of BC Welfare	7
4	Consumer Affairs, Food and Civil Supplies	Commissioner, Civil Supplies	7
5	LETf	Commissioner, of Labour	18
		Directorate of Insurance	3
6	Planning	DE & S	4
7	YATC	AP Tourism Authority	5
8	Industries & Commerce	Commissioner of Industries	12
9	Housing	APSH Corporation	3
10	MA & UD	APTIDCO	4
		MEPMA	5
		ENC, PH	4
		Commissioner & Director of Municipal Admn.	19
		Director of Town & Cournty Plg.	9
		SWA	8
11	HM & FW	Commissioner of Health & FW	56
		CEO, Aarogysri	4
12	Skill Development & Training	Commissioner of Tech.Education	1
13	Energy	Energy	14
14	School Education	Commissioner of School Education	51
		Commissioner of Intermediate Education	7
15	EFST	APPCB	15
		PCCF	22
		AP Bio-diversity Board	3
16	Finance	Finance	9
		Director of Treasury & Accounts	1
		SLBC	7

Mapping (2)

- **Department to Scheme**
 - **The mapping was further extended to scheme and scheme components.**

Goal 1 : End poverty in all its forms everywhere

S.I.No.	Indicator Name	SDG Index-2019	SDG Index-2020	Direction of change over last year	Department(s) concerned	Department Strategies
1	Population below poverty line (%)	9.20	9.20	--	RD/Civil Supplies	This data was released by the then Planning Commission in the year 2011-12
2	MPI Head count ratio (%)		15.60		LET&F/DE&S	
3	Households covered by health scheme/insurance (%)	74.60	74.60	--	CEO Arogyasri	
4	MGNREGA - Employment provided against demanded (%)	91.28	83.81		Rural Development	To ensure that all those who demand work instantly get opportunity to work. Maintain shelf of works, especially in these Covid-19 times
5	Beneficiaries under PMMVY (%)		96.40		Health and Family Welfare	To enroll all eligible lactating mothers
6	Households living in katcha houses (%)	3.20	3.20	--	Housing/ APTIDCO	The MoRD have allocated 1.79 lakh houses to the state under PMAY-G for FY 2021-22. The number would increase

Goal related schemes:

YSR Pension Kanuka, YSR Asara, YSR Rythu Bharosa, Jagananna Amma Vodi, Jagannana Gorumudda, YSR Sampoorna Poshna, YSR Sampoorna Plus, YSR Vahana Mitra, YSR Nethanna Nestham, Jagananna Chedhodu, YSR Cheyutha, YSR Bhima, YSR Jagananna Badugu Vikasam Honorarium to Imams/ Mouzzains, Archakas and Pastors, YSR Matsyakara Bharosa

Action for improving the performance

Prl. Secy. RD(SERP, Comr. RD)
Secy, Civil Supplies
Prl. Secy, Health(Arogyasri)
Prl. Secy, MA&UD(TIDCO)

Mapping (3)

- **Target setting and interventions by Departments**
 - **Annual targets set and, in turn, departments to**
 - - **identify the programmatic activities that contribute to achievement of targets on the indicators, and**
 - **disaggregate targets at the VWS level as well as monitor at that level. This leads to Localization of SDGs!!!**

Secretariat Department : Health, Medical & Family Welfare

HoD Name	Goal	Indicator	Unit of Indicator
COMMISSIONER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE	Goal 1 : End Poverty	1.3.1 : No.of Universal Health cards distributed to persons with annual income below Rs. 5 lakh under YSR Arogyasri	Crore Number
	Goal 1 : End Poverty	1.3.1a: Percentage of households with any usual member covered by a health scheme or health insurance	%
	Goal 1 : End Poverty	1.3.3b: Percentage of the population (out of total eligible population) receiving social protection benefits under Pradhan Mantri Matru Vandana Yojana (PMMVY)	%
	Goal 1 : End Poverty	1.5a.2 : Proportion of total government allocation on health	%
	Goal 2 : End Hunger	2.1.1 : Percentage of children aged under 5 years who are underweight.	%
	Goal 2 : End Hunger	2.2.3 : Percentage of women whose Body Mass Index (BMI) is below normal (BMI<18.5 kg/m2)	%
	Goal 2 : End Hunger	2.2.4 : Percentage of pregnant women age 15-49 years who are anaemic (<11.0g/dl)	%
	Goal 2 : End Hunger	2.2.5 : Percentage of Children age 6-59 months who are anaemic (<11.0g/dl)	%
	Goal 2 : End Hunger	2.2.5a: Percentage of adolescents aged 10–19 years who are anaemic	%
	Goal 3 : Health and well-being	3.1.1 : Maternal Mortality Ratio	Rate (per 1 lakh. live births)
	Goal 3 : Health and well-being	3.1.2 : Percentage of births attended by skilled health personnel (Period 5 years)	%
	Goal 3 : Health and well-being	3.1.3 : Percentage of births attended by skilled health	%

Secretariat Department : School Education

HoD Name	Goal	Indicator	Unit of Indicator
Commissioner of School Education	Goal 1 : End Poverty	1.5a.1 : Proportion of total government allocation on education	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.1a : Net Enrolment Ratio in primary	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.1b : Net Enrolment Ratio in upper primary	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.1b : Net Enrolment Ratio in Secondary	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.2a : Adjusted Net Enrolment Ratio in primary	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.2b : Adjusted Net Enrolment Ratio in upper primary	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.2d: Adjusted Net Enrolment Ratio (ANER) in elementary education (class 1-8)	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.2e: Average annual dropout rate at secondary level (class 9-10)	Ratio (per 100)
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4: Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 3 - Mathematics (%)	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4a: Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 3 - EVS (%)	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4b:Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 3 - Language (%)	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4c:Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 5 - Mathematics (%)	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4d: Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 5 - EVS (%)	%
	Goal 4 : Quality Education	4.1.4e: Performing Learning Outcomes - In Class 5 - Language (%)	%



Mix of top-down and bottom-up

The Top-down Strategy

- ❑ AP Ranked 4 (2021 SDG ranking)
- ❑ **115** Indicators used by NITI
- ❑ Mapping shows that - District level - **61** indicators; VWS level - **47** indicators
- ❑ **20 Indicators** at VWS level will improve our ranking --
 - ❑ 8 Priority indicators are in areas connected to **Anaemia Management, Reducing Malnourishment, Reducing Dropouts** and Improving Basic Infrastructure in Schools.
 - ❑ Other indicators are related to Crimes and Road Accidents, Percentage Use of nitrogenous fertilizers, Percentage of rural population getting safe and adequate drinking water within premises through Pipe Water Supply (PWS) , Installed sewage treatment capacity.

Bottom-up: Bringing them together

- Action located at all ~15,000 Village and Ward Secretariats
- Bring all field staff together at VWS level
- Each department do focused and targeted implementation of their interventions.
- Connect all by relying on digital technology.
- Do monthly assessment of effect of implementation
- Modify from feedback on implementation and assessment.
- Key role of the **Family Doctor** in SDG 3.



Combining SDG 3 and SDG 17 and applying to health

2 Focus areas of Intervention – 4 Priority Indicators

Anemia



1. Percentage of adolescent females aged 10-19 years who are Anaemic
2. Percentage of pregnant women aged 15-49 years who are Anaemic

Malnourishment



1. Percentage of children under 5 years who are stunted
2. Percentage of children under 5 years who are underweight



Focus area # 1

Focus Area # 1- Anaemia

Adolescent Females aged 10-19 years who are Anaemic

Target – 9% (Kerala)
Achievement – 60.1%
(NFHS 5)

Health & Family Welfare, School
Education Department,
Home Department

Pregnant Women (15-49) who are Anaemic

Target – 23% (Kerala)
Achievement – 53.7%
(NFHS 5)

Health & Family Welfare, Women
& Child Department


Anaemia – Mapping to Scheme Interventions & Activities

Scheme driven Interventions

YSR Sampoorna Poshana, YSR Sampoorna Poshana Plus, Village Health Clinics and Family Doctor, Nadu Nedu in Health, Jagananna Gorumudda, Ammavodi, DISHA

Indicators and Activities

- ❖ **Adolescent Females aged 10-19 years who are Anaemic** - Attendance of Children to School, Midday Meal Quality, Vaccination, Deworming & IFA Supplementation, Monitor Adolescent Health Programme (RKSK), Hygiene Status of Schools and Child Marriages.
- ❖ **Pregnant Women (15-49) who are Anaemic** – Pregnant Women Registered in RCH App, Anaemia Screening & Testing of Pregnant women from ANM APP, Anaemia Cases Management in YSR Sampoorna Poshana APP



**Bringing them together – field
workers and their activities using
digital technology**

Intervention	VSWS Functionary	Activity	Visit Schedule	Inspection components	Actions	Monitoring
<p>Village Health Clinics, Jagananna Sampoorna Poshana, Jagananna Sampoorna Poshana Plus,</p>	<p>Health: ANM, MLHP and Medical officer</p> <p>WCD: AWW, CDPO</p>	<p>Anaemia Surveillance, Testing and Management</p>	<p>ANM -To do the anaemia surveillance /Screening of PW, LW, 5-19 years and 20-49 WRA(Women in Reproductive age)</p> <p>ANM -Data Entry in RCH – PW & LW NCD/CD app for 5-19 & 20-49 WRA</p> <p>ANM/MO - Monitor and ensure 100% testing is completed for pregnant women and adolescent girls</p>	<p>ANM - Information regarding anaemia cases of subcentre available in ANM App</p> <p>AWW - Information of Anaemia cases of Anganwadi will be available in YSR Sampoorna Poshana App</p>	<p>AWW/CDPO –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Proper nutritious diet to pregnant women & out of school adolescent girls <input type="checkbox"/> All PW & LW consume one IFA red tablet, adolescent consume blue IFA tablets <input type="checkbox"/> Create awareness among the public on nutritional causes of anaemia <p>ANM/MO –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ensure prophylaxis treatment according to AMB guidelines <input type="checkbox"/> Monitor & ensure treatment of severe and moderate anaemia <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Refer to CHC/AH/DH/GGH for transfusion 	<p>CDPO –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Poor performing AWWs to be identified and improved <p>MO –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitor progress of Anaemia testing in ANM App <p>DMHO –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Poor Performance Secretariats/Sub centres are tracked and monitored <p>District Women & Child Welfare –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitor Low performing CDPOs, Stocks



Focus area # 2

Focus Area # 2 - Malnourishment

Percentage of Children Under 5 years Stunted

Target – 20% (Tamil Nadu)
Achievement – 31.2% (NFHS 5)

Women & Child Department,
Health & Family Welfare,
School Education Department

Percentage of Children Under 5 years Underweight

Target – 19% (Kerala)
Achievement – 29.6% (NFHS 5)

Women & Child Department,
Health & Family Welfare,
School Education Department


Malnourishment - Mapping to Scheme Interventions & Activities

Scheme driven Interventions

YSR Sampoorna Poshana, YSR Sampoorna Poshana Plus, Village Health Clinics, Nadu Nedu in Health

Indicators and Activities

- ❖ **Percentage of Children Under 5 Stunted-** Attendance of Children to School, Midday Meal Quality, Vaccination, Deworming & IFA Supplementation, Hygiene Status of Schools and YSR Sampoorna Poshana, Malnourishment among children – YSR Sampoorna Poshna APP
- ❖ **Percentage of Children Under 5 Underweight** – Attendance of Children to School, Midday Meal Quality, Vaccination, Deworming & IFA Supplementation, Hygiene Status of Schools and YSR Sampoorna Poshana, Malnourishment among children – YSR Sampoorna Poshna APP



**Bringing them together – field
workers and their activities using
digital technology**

Intervention	VSWS Functionary	Activity	Visit Schedule	Inspection components	Actions	Monitoring
YSR Sampoorna Poshana	Mahila Police Women & Child Department – Supervisor & CDPO	Maintenance of Cleanlines	Physical inspections of Mahila Samrakshana Karyadarshi/ Mahila Police once a week to each Anganwadi Center in her jurisdiction	Mahila Police needs monitor and capture the photos where cooking area, food storage safe drinking water, sanitation in and etc.	Mahila Police has to provide feedback to the supervisor on maintenance of cleanliness.	Supervisor/C DPO - Analyze and identify the issues pertaining to cleanliness and escalate the same to supervisor.
YSR Sampoorna Poshana	Mahila Police Women & Child Department – Supervisor & CDPO	Quality of food stocks	Visit Anganwadi Center about the quality of stocks by MSK / MP and upload in the database Check the quality of food stocks Check the shelf life of each commodity and FIFO	Mahila Police Ensure updation of visit observations pertaining to quality of stocks in the database.	Mahila Police has to provide feedback to supervisor on quality of food commodities.	Supervisor/C DPO - Analyzing the data in YSR SP app dashboard, supervisor has to review the quality of stocks

Intervention	VSWS Functionary	Activity	Visit Schedule	Inspection components	Actions	Monitoring
<p>YSR Sampoorna Poshana YSR SP app</p>	<p>Mahila Police</p> <p>Women & Child Department – Supervisor & CDPO</p>	<p>Hot cooked meal</p>	<p>Physical inspection of MSK/MP to Anganwadi Centers to supervise cleaning of raw materials, cooking is done in clean utensils, vegetable/leafy vegetables procured are free from odor, menu is being followed and drawing ration as per quantity prescribed</p>	<p>Mahila Police - Ensure updation of visit observations pertaining to hot cooked meal in the database.</p>	<p>Mahila Police - has to provide feedback to supervisor on quality of hot cooked meal.</p>	<p>Mahila Police – Identify issues pertaining to Hot cooked meal and escalate to supervisor.</p> <p>Supervisor - % of AWCs where menu is not being followed % of AWCs not being drawn as per number of beneficiaries.</p> <p>CDPO - % of beneficiaries regularly eating hot cooked meal.</p>

Intervention	VSWS Functionary	Activity	Visit Schedule	Inspection components	Actions	Monitoring
Village Health Clinic	Health: ANM, ASHA and Medical officer	Vaccination, deworming and IFA supplementation	ANM-Monthly school visit along with ASHA and GSWS staff	ANM -Check vaccination status from Reproductive and Child Health portal, deworming and IFA from school registers to be maintained	ANM -Missing doses to be administered on spot and data updated in portal and registers	MO/DMHO - Coverage be tracked for each child.
Village Health Clinic	Health: ANM, ASHA and Medical officer	Malnourishment of Pregnant & Lactating mothers and 0-5 years children	Monthly Growth Monitoring watch for signs of malnourishment and health	Update database with Growth monitoring data on monthly basis	Educate and ensure proper feeding at appropriate intervals Take help of Asha worker, ANM, Nutrition Rehabilitation Centre (NRC) & PHC where needed	Check if the situation improves If not improving consult Nutrition Rehabilitation Centre (NRC) & PHC
Village Health Clinic	Health: ANM, ASHA and Medical officer	Malnutrition status of children	ANM Monthly school visit along with ASHA and GSWS staff	Height weight and growth appropriate to age, visible signs of anaemia	Children with poor indicators to be identified and tagged to Head Master, SHG, GSWS staff for monitoring.	Monthly improvement deterioration measured for each child

Consistent Rhythms – What is closing the loop

- **Closing the loop means –**
 - **Giving a name to numbers at VWS level.**
 - **Bringing all functions and functionaries together at the VWS level.**
- **Prepared by the Departments – Task Force Established.**

Orientation sessions

- **Several rounds of orientation meetings organized –**
 - **Secretaries/ HoDs to government at the State level, and**
 - **District Collectors/Joint Collectors/Municipal level officers at the District level.**
- **Focus of these sensitization workshops was on understanding the SDGs, articulation of their connection to programmes (and components) and to the targets set out in the 115 indicators in the SIF.**

Capacity Building

- **Completed continuous trainings for officers at multi-levels.**
- **The training was hybrid (face-to-face and virtual) and tailor-made.**

Sustaining the Effort over time

- **Coherence between SDGs, indicators, departments, Village and Ward Secretariats, targets, achievements, monitoring and capacity building is achieved by –**
 - **Including the indicators and targets in the Annual Performance Appraisals of the top civil servants.**